

1 BREAKTHROUGH 1  
1 TO 1  
1 FIRST LEVELS 1

2 By the same author

1 Breakthrough to Learning Gemora 1 1 Breakthrough to Dynamic Correction 1 1 Breakthrough to  
Breakthrough to Understanding Gemora 1 1 Breakthrough to Thinking for Yourself 1  
An Educational Project of

FRAMEWORK

מסגרת outsid

FRAMEWORK למסגרת

FRAMEWORK P.O.B 43127 Har Nof Jerusalem ISRAEL

Framework U.S. Office 477 E.81st Street Kansas City MO 64131 Tel. 816-444-7178

Editorial Board Rabbi Menachem Rubin Rabbi Baruch Weiner Rabbi Nosson Fabien Yitzchok M  
'Breakthrough' Series: Book 4

BREAKTHROUGH

TO THE

FIRST LEVELS

A Gemora-study resource manual for rebbeim and talmidim

Zvi Zobin

Jerusalem, Israel 5752 4

COPYRIGHT NOTICE

any part of this book for reviews

or for educational purposes

Limited

in

Individuals or Institutions who wish to copy extensive parts of the book or who basis are requested to apply for registration as Registered Users. Registration will entitle Users to make unlimited copies of Worksheets, to receive continued development of techniques and to receive ASCII files of the text so adapt Worksheets to their own particular requirements, during the period

(c) 1992 Zvi Zobin Ponim Meiroth 17 / 1 Kiryat Mattersdorf P.O.B. 6597 Jerusalem, Israel 02 - 3

1 .N:1 .H: The First Levels Approbations .H: .H: .H: .F: .F: .F: .F:...

Rabbi N. Ordman הרב נ. ארדמאן Principal of Yeshiva " Etz Chaim " כ"א שבט תשנ"ב

3 HELENSLEA AVENUE, LONDON, NW11 8NE Tel. 01-455-2013

אל כבוד ידידי ותלמידי היקר ח"יב ועסקן בהרבצת תורה מוהר"ר צבי זובין שליט"א

Rabbi Zvi Zobin, שליט"א, a former student of our Yeshiva, is well known to me as a genuine מים is an outstanding pedagogue and מרביץ תורה.

The sefer is designed to show the student how he can relate to the גמרא and organise his understanding person will enjoy learning גמרא and make the most progress when he "lives in it", appreciating the While I am not familiar with modern methods of teaching גמרא, anything which enhances the uncertainty in basic פשוט is to be praised and will open the avenues to more advanced learning.

וחזקה על חבר שאינו מוציא מתחת ידו דבר שאינו מתוקן

With warmest personal good wishes

ברגשי ברכה והצלחה

הרב נ. ארדמאן לונדון

2

YESHIVAT KETER TORAH ישיבת קתר חורה Rabbi Raphael Lapin, Dean ש ישיבה

טו שבט תשנ"ב לפ"ק פה עיה"ק ירושלים תובב"א

Rav Zvi Zobin שליט"א presented before me his work "Breakthrough to the First Levels" designed textual analysis and to aid teachers in effectively giving it over.

It is textual analysis which is the sine qua non of conceptual analysis (commonly known as "ps" and yet so neglected in to-days' gemmorah education curriculum.

Rav Zobin, שליט"א, who is himself a recognized authority and consultant in gemorah education, however, I would like to express how impressed I was with his work both in terms of methodology, certain that it will make a significant contribution to to-days Torah world.

יזכהו העליון להמשיך בעבודתו להעמיד תלמידים על דרך הפשוט להגדיל תורה ולהאדירה רפאל אלי לפין

3 .H: The First Levels

Introduction .H: .H: .H: .F: .F: .F: .F:...\$\$\$...

This work is directed to the most basic level of Gemora - understanding and appreciating the act Amoraim. By virtue of being the most basic level, it is also the most critical. If a person wishes to first grasp the layout of the entire map.

After arriving in America, Rav Ya'akov Kaminetzky זצ"ל's first post was at the Torah VoDass People attending his shiurim were disappointed by their apparent low level. They seemed to discuss basic peshot. "Is this the famous Rabbi Kaminetsky whose fame reached us ever people asked. One day, Rav Kaminetzky delivered an amazing shiur in which he culled chidus Poskim. "Ah!" people thought, "This is what we have been waiting for!" After the Shiur, talmidim. "I am sorry that I could not give my usual shiur, but last night I went to a chassunal and I was not able to prepare for the it. Tomorrow I hope that I will be able to give shiur as us Rav Nosson Kaminetsky שליט"א.)

Newcomers to Rav Nochum Perzovitz זצ"ל's world-famous shiur in the Mir Yeshiva in Jerusalem

apparent simplicity.

I once asked Rav Zvi Kushalevsky שליט"א (Rosh Yeshiva, Haichal HaTorah, Jerusalem) if teaching. He replied that he insisted that his talmidim should know the basic pshot of the Gemara absolutely clearly.

4 There are two aspects to attaining clarity at the basic level. Firstly, you must appreciate the re argument. Secondly, you must understand the flow of the sugya and how each stage follows logi Then, after you have worked out the complete flow of the text, you must be able to retain the co mind as an entire unit.

For the first aspect, I have given examples of common terms, showing how these terms would be should try to isolate other standard terms and think of your own examples showing how they are For the second aspect, I have given selections of two methods for graphically displaying an entire structured walkthrough , which shows the spatial relationship between parts of the sugya. The ot which shows the effect of each part of the sugya on the other.

Devising a method for retaining the entirety of a sugya in your mind is an intensely personal matt person can be completely baffling to another. You must work out which method which is most si fascinated by flowcharts. Other people are dismayed by them. Some people write a synopsis of th with an outline of the sugya or a just a sequence of key words. Others like a simple classified cha collections of information and store them on filecards.

Once the basics of the sugya are clear and they are impressed upon the mind, learning through me enjoyable.

## 5 HOW TO USE THE BOOK

This book is designed to be used as a reference book. When you encounter one of the standard te given in the third part. Then find an example from a Gemora in the fourth part. See how the term role in the progression of the Gemora's discussion.

The first part of the book comprises a discussion of the basic level of making a liness , distingui translation of the text and its idiomatic meaning.

The second part of the book comprises a discussion of the primary stages of understanding Gem standard formats of charts. The making of notes and charts are an invaluable aid to attaining cla attitude to learning. As a famous Rosh Yeshiva said,

Let your pen (קנה) be your friend קנה לך חבר

The third part comprises a dictionary of standard words and phrases, illustrated by examples in ev help you to relate to the discussions of the Gemra as real- life arguments in which you can becom The fourth part comprises a selection of small sugyas for you to practise on.

I have deliberately kept the everyday examples of the second and third parts in a standard format reading through the whole part in one session both boring and confusing. Using a standard forma contrast similar terms, so that you can define clearly the power of each term.

6 As with all "mechanical" help to learning Gemora, whether they are books, tapes or computer replace the rebbi-talmid relationship which is the basis of the Oral Law. These accessories can ofi but the role of the rebbi goes beyond the simple transfer of information.

When Rabbi Boruch Ber Leibowitz first returned to his home town of Slutsk after learning t his neighbours tried to convince him that the long and arduous return journey to Brisk was a v haMedrash here, stocked with the finest seforim." they argued, "You do not need to go back to the s'voras you need from the seforim here." Rabbi Boruch Ber was not convinced, but still, th he returned to Brisk, he asked Reb Chaim where lay the fallacy of their reasoning. Reb Chair were correct, "If you think of a s'vorah and then see it in a Ketzos, you know that it is goo you can have a s'vorah and not see it in a sefer - then you need the rebbi to tell if it is correct train you." (Heard from Rabbi Rafoel Lopin שליט"א)

(עיין ספר רוח חיים על אבות פרק ו' ד"ה "הלומד מחבירו")

7 .R:C When you first begin to look into the text, keep in mind that both the one who is asking and the one who is answering are all intelligent people who weigh each word with care and thought.

First, happily read aloud the entire text two or three times. Then try to grasp its plain meaning. Then read it through again and try to see the implications of what has been written. The first level is called insight. Experts in logic call the simple meaning the introduction and the insight the consequence. and the second level is called insight. Experts in logic call the simple meaning the introduction and the insight the consequence.

The straightforward way is to first to understand as much as you can whether or not the way you understand it agrees with the way explained by the Commentator.

When you first start to look into the text, firstly, go over the entire text to get a general idea. Then go over it again and see how it fits into the general picture. Then, when you plan, go over the text again and see if you agree with the author's plan.

.R:F .H: The First Levels	Contents .H: .H: .F: .F: .F:....\$\$\$...	8 .R:F
Approbations. . . . .	Introduction. . . . .	3 Ho
. . . . . 4		
Part 1 The basic levels of reading the Gemora. . . . .		7
The first steps . . . . .	8 Unpacking the text . . . . .	9 Building up a
Part 2 The first stages of understanding the Gemora. . . . .		15
Let us have a Conversation. . . . .	16 Clearing the fog. . . . .	17 The Fir
The Second Stage . . . . .	19 The Third Stage . . . . .	22 Making a
.25 A Classified Chart . . . . .	.26 A Structured Walkthrough . . . . .	.28 A
. . . . .30 Flowchart of the sugya . . . . .	31 Flashcards . . . . .	32 Index
Notebooks . . . . .	34 Choosing a method. . . . .	35 The classi
Part 3 Standard Words and Phrases		37
38 . . . . . רמי	38. . . . . רמיניה	38. . . . . רמי
. . . . . 39 מיתבי	. . . . . 39 איתביה	. . . . . 40 בעיא
. . . . . 41 אבעיא להו	. . . . . 41 בעא מיניה	. . . . . 42
. . . . . 42	. . . . . 41 בשלמה. . . . . אלא	. . . . . 43 אילימא. . . . . הא. . . . . אלא לאו
. . . . . 44 לא שנו אלא. . . . . אבל	. . . . . 46 מאי לאו בהא קמיפלגי	. . . . . 49 ניפלוג ולישנא בדידי
. . . . . 47 לא מבעי קאמר	. . . . . 50 תסתיים	. . . . . 52 הכי השתה
. . . . . 52 ולטעמיד	. . . . . 54 לא שנא. . . . . ולא שנא	. . . . . 54 אמאי לא
. . . . . 55		
9 The Thirteen Rules by which the Torah is expounded		56
56 . . . . . 1. לא ראי זה כראי זה ולא ראי זה כראי זה. . . . .		
. . . . . 2. גזרה שוה. . . . .		
. . . . . 3. בנין אב. . . . .		
. . . . . 4. כלל ופרט וכלל. . . . .		
. . . . . 5. פרט וכלל. . . . .		
. . . . . 6. רבוי ומיעוט ורבוי. . . . .		
. . . . . 7. כלל		
. . . . . 8. כל דבר שהיה בכלל ויצא מן הכלל ללמד לא ללמד על עצמו יצא אלא ללמד על הכלל כולו		
. . . . . 9. כל דבר שטעון אחר שהוא כענינו יצא להקל ולא להחמיר. . . . .		
. . . . . 10. כל דבר שהיה בכלל		

נו יצא להקל ולהחמיר. . . . 64. 11. כל דבר שהיה בכלל ויצא לדון בדבר החדש אי אתה יכול להחזירו לכללועד  
 6' 12. דבר הלמד מענינו ודבר הלומד מסופו. . . . . 65. 13. שני כתובים המכחישים זה את זה עד שיבוא  
 66. Failure הכתוב השלישי ויכריע ביניהם. . . . . 65. . . . .  
 Part 4 Sample Sugyos . . . . . 67  
 סוכה ל. . . . . 72. סוכה לא: . . . . . 76. סוכה 68  
 84. ב"ב ב: . . . . . 88. ב"ב ב: . . . . .  
 96. קידושין ג: . . . . . 100. סוכה לב. . . . .  
 108. סוכה לד. . . . . 112. כתובות ב: . . . . .  
 116. סוכה לה. . . . . 120. . . . .  
 Dictionary. . . . . 122  
 Part 5 Some general guidelines from ספר הליכות עולם . . 127  
 Appendix - The importance of knowing history . . . . . 131  
 Index . . . . . 133  
 10 .H: The First Levels Part 1 Reading the Gemora .H: .H: .F: .F: .F:...\$\$\$...

Part 1

THE BASIC LEVELS OF

READING THE

GEMORA

11 THE FIRST STEPS

Step 1 See what the general topic of the sugya is

The Mishna : סוכה כט A stolen  
 invalid (for use on Succos as one of the four species) והיבש פסול

Step 2 Read through the text 3 or 4 times.

ביום טוב שני בשלמא יבש הדר בעינן וליכא אלא גזול בשלמא יום טוב רשאון דכתיב לכם 5גמי5 קא פסיק  
 אלא ביום טוב שני אמאי לא אייר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי משום דהוה ליה מצוה הבאה בעבירה

Step 4 Look for the KEY WORDS

ביום טוב שני בשלמא יבש הדר בעינן וליכא אלא גזול בשלמא יום טוב רשאון דכתיב לכם 5גמי5 קא פסיק  
 לא ביום טוב שני אמאי לא אייר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי משום דהוה ליה מצוה הבאה בעבירה

12 Step 5 Divide the text into phrases

דכתיב בשלמא יבש הדר בעינן וליכא ותני לא שנה ביו"ט ראשון ולא שנה ביום אגמ"ט קא פסיק עבירה לא א"ר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי לכם משלכם אלא ביום טוב שני אלא אמאי גזול

Step 6 Understand each phrase (Unpack the text)

טוב שני בשלמא יבש הדר בעינן וליכא אלא גזול בשלמא יום טוב ראשון דכתיב לכם אגמ"ט קא פסיק ותני אלא ביום טוב שני אמאי לא א"ר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי משום דהוה ליה מצוה הבאה בעבירה

13 UNPACKING THE TEXT

You will not be able to understand the Gemora simply by reading through the Gemora as if it is the Mishna and Gemora in the way the Tannaim and Amoraim want us to understand it. So, the reconstitute the Oral Law and then we study that reconstituted Oral Law. This means that we must know the idiomatic meaning. On the other hand, we need to know the literal meaning of the words as well. Firstly, because it is easier to remember idiomatic meanings if we know the literal meaning. Secondly, because sometimes the words are used literally.

Therefore we need to know both the literal and the idiomatic meanings of the text.

For example,

פוק חזו means idiomatically - The difference is ..... הנפק is a document issued by פוק חזו and see for yourself!

If you do not know the literal meanings of these three examples, then you will have to remember if you know that the word פוק is Aramaic for "Go out", then you will be able to see how the idiomatic meaning is derived from the literal meanings.

נפקא מינה means literally - "Goes out from it" = "The difference between them"

הנפקא is a document which goes out of בית דין

פוק חזו means literally - "Go out! Look!" = "Go and see for yourself!" 14 Literal meaning

surely (a word to denote certainty) קא The Mishna decides, decide

and ... ו and we learn: learn ני

of שני - learn the ש of the Hebrew word is changed ת

no/not לא There is no difference whether difference

... ב it is the first day of Yom Tov good day יו"ט is

first ראשון and ... ו

whether no לא it is the second day of Yom Tov difference

in/regarding ... ב day יום

טוב second שני granted/agreed

is the halocho dry יבש regarding when the

הדר Because it needs to be beautiful we need בעינן בעי =

and ... ו and it is not (because it is dry) there isn't כא

אלא But regarding when it is stolen stolen גזול = steal גזול gran

Granted, that that is the halacha day יום on the first day of Yom-t

טוב 15 Literal meaning גמרא Idiomatic meaning first

... ד because it is written "yours" it is written כתוב

from ... מ it has to belong to you. of

yours לכם but לא But on the second

regarding ... ב day יום

טוב second שני why

be alright? no/not לא Said אמר R

Rebbi the name of Rebbi Shimon Yochanan

in the name of משום Rebbi רבי

שמעון	the son of	בן	Yochai
Because	משום	Because it is	זה
ליה	a mitzva	מצוה	a mitzva which
a sin	through	... ב	comes through
			a sin

16 After we have worked out the idiomatic meaning of the text, we must now put it all together of the sugya

We learnt in the Mishna

לולב הגזול והיבש פסול

A stolen and a dry lulav are unsuitable

So, regarding the unsuitability of these lulavim,

קא פסיק ותני

The Mishna decides, and we learn

Since the Mishna does not stipulate any particular day we must assume that

לא שנה

There is no difference whether

ביום ראשון

it is the first day of Yom Tov when it is a mitzva of the Torah

ולא שנה ביום טוב שני

And there is no difference whether it is the second day of Yom Tov when it is a mitzva of the Ra

Regarding this fact that the Mishna applies the halacha to both days

בשלמא יבש

Granted, that this should be the halacha regarding when the lulav is dry because...

הדר בעינן

it needs to be beautiful both on the day when the mitzva is from the Torah and on the days wh

וליכא

and it is not beautiful because it is dry

So I can understand why it is not suitable on both days

אלא גזול

But regarding when it is stolen

(remembering that a thief does not attain ownership of the object he steals simply by his stealin

בשלמא 17

Granted, that its unsuitability is the halacha

יום טוב ראשון

on the first day of Yom-tov

because then the mitzva is from the Torah

דכתיב לכם

because in the Torah it is written "yours" and from this we learn that

משלכם

it has to belong to you and the stolen lulav does not belong to the thief

אלא ביום טוב שני

But on the second day of Yom-tov, when the mitzva is from the Rabbonim

אמאי לא!?

why should it not be alright ?!

א"ר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי

Rabbi Yochanan said in the name of Rabbi Shimon ben Yochai

משום דהוה ליה מצוה הבאה בעבירה

Because it will then be a mitzva which came through the person doing a sin.

Note how the words of the text act as a skeleton around which the intended meaning of the su  
 When you go to a shiur, listen to how the Maggid Shiur translates words and phrases idiomatical  
 When you write the translations of words down in your notebook, try to write down both the lite  
 translations.

### 18 BUILDING UP A VOCABULARY

You can build-up your vocabulary by writing down all new words in a special notebook.  
 This will then become your own, personal dictionary in which you translate words as your rebbe  
 Include prefixes, because many prefixes have several possible meanings.

י	why	יום	day	אלא	but.....	יבש	dry	א	י	R:C
ל	we need	לכם	yours	ביום	by day.....	לא	no	ב	ל	
מ	from y	גזול	stolen.....	משום	in the name of....	ג	because.....	מ	מ	
	Gemora...	גמ'								
פ		דכתיב	as it is written..	פסיק	decide	ד		פ		
ק		הדר	beauty.....	קא	surely	ה		ק		
ר	and	רשאון	permission .....	ולכא	and there isn't..	ו	ראשון	ר		
ש	Pre	טוב	good.....	שני	second	ש	Mishna difference	ש		
	on.....	ב	that.....	ו	and.....	ו	from.....	ו		

19 .H: The First Levels Part 2 Understanding the Gemora .H: .H: .H: .F: .F: .F: .F:  
 Part 2

### The Basic Stages of Understanding the Gemora

#### 20 .R:F 8LET US HAVE A CONVERSATION 8

Basically, the Gemora is made up of many conversations between Tannaim and between Amoraim  
 thinking about the nature of a conversation.

If you tell me something and I respond to what you said, we are having a conversation. I might s  
 give a smile of agreement or a frown and grunt of disagreement and you might then respond back  
 were saying. If I do not respond at all, we are not conversing - you are narrating and I am only li  
 There is only one reason why you should want to tell me something. That is because you think th  
 want to tell me. (Of course, here we are discussing purely intellectual discussions like those of th  
 statement you make must contain information that you think I do not now know.

For example, you might want to tell me a fact that you think I do not know. So, the new informa  
 want to tell me that I am making a mistake. So, the new information will be that what I think is c  
 might want to reassure me that something I am not sure about is really correct. So, the new infor  
 element of doubt I have is not justified.

My response to your statement will be the result of my reaction to the new information. Similarly depend upon how justified you think it is.

We can therefore break down a conversation into stages of discussion.

The first stage is the basic statement you made. The second stage is my response to your statement my response.

If discussion of that statement continues, the conversation can comprise further levels - four, five and forth between us.

Intensive analysis of conversation is the topic of Book 5 in the 9Breakthrough Series - Breakthrough which is based on the RAMCHAL's sefer תבונות דרך. Now, we are concerned with the basic stage information into a clearly-understandable sequence.

Let me now introduce the two heroes of this book, Reuven and Shimon. They are both long-time Yeshiva. Reuven is forever looking for an excuse to go swimming. Shimon feels that it is his life's impulses. Being both highly trained in the eclectic intellectual rigours of Gemora, Shimon knows appeals are pointless. They will be subjected to Reuven's razor-sharp analysis and unceremonious for success only if he uses indisputable authorities coupled with 21 cast-iron, irrefutable logic.

In the Yeshiva are two major authorities, the Rosh Yeshiva and the Mashgiach. Both are great T' honored and respected by all, including each other. Neither one would like to contradict the other's opinions, though the Mashgiach would be the first to insist that the Rosh Yeshiva is the ultimate says goes!

Of course, when considering these discussions, our own views of the virtues of swimming are irrelevant. We should consider the merits of the arguments. Reuven feels they should print waterproof Gemoras so that Shimon believes everything has its time and place - but he feels that there's not much time or place to put up the better argument!

## 22 CLEARING THE FOG 9

Before we enter the fray of the arguments, we should spend a few moments considering the tool: sentences.

In order to understand what a person is really saying, we must - understand what he is really saying but, like many obvious facts, it is often overlooked. Let us look into this matter a bit deeper.

To understand what a person is saying we must :- First - hear what he is saying Second - The first requirement is quite simple - we must determine exactly what he said.

The second requirement is more demanding.

We must first determine what he is talking about. Then we must determine what he is saying about. The first part of the statement is called the 9 subject 9 of the statement.

The second part of the statement is called the 9 predicate 9 of the statement.

Accurate analysis requires clear and careful thinking.

You must listen to 9 exactly 9 what is being said.

For example, the Mishna says,

"A stolen and a dry lulav are posul"

The Mishna is telling us about a stolen and a dry lulav, so,

The 9 subject 9 of the sentence is a stolen and a dry lulav

The Mishna is telling that this type of lulav is posul, so

The 9 predicate 9 of the sentence is that it is posul

The 9 predicate 9 is what the sentence is telling

23 If the Mishna would have said, "A man may not use a stolen or dry lulav."

the subject would be - a man and the predicate would be - that he may not use a stolen or dry lulav

At first glance, there seems to be no difference between the two texts - both ban use of a stolen lulav. We will show you that there is a major difference between the two.

The subject of the second text is - a man.

Therefore, it does not apply to a woman or child.

Therefore, we could deduce from the second text that a woman or child may use a stolen or dry lulav. But the subject of the real text of the Mishna is - a stolen or dry lulav.

The Mishna says that it is posul, without limitation as to who wants to use it.

Therefore, we deduce from the Mishna that such a lulav is not suitable for anybody.

Therefore, no-one may use such a lulav.

.R:F Clear thinking requires precise definitions. .R:F

24 10 F I R S T S T A G E 10

.R:F STATEMENT Reuven says, "You may go swimming." .R:F

Subject Reuven is telling us what YOU may do

Reuven says, "YOU may go swimming."

So, YOU are the subject

Topic Reuven is talking about GOING SWIMMING

Predicate Reuven is telling us about you,

Reuven says, "You MAY GO SWIMMING."

So, the predicate is 10 may go swimming 10

Inference Reuven must be assuming that we think that you MAY NOT go swimming

New information Reuven is informing us that you MAY go swimming

But the statement omits information, much of which we must know before we may act on it!

Scope When is swimming permitted? Where is swimming permitted? What type of

The fact that Reuven did not mention any limitations implies that there are NO limitations.

Authority Who is Reuven? How reliable is he? What is the basis for his statement such a statement?

The Real Message Reuven is telling us:-

You may go swimming, wherever you like, whenever you like and however you like.

25 10 F I R S T S T A G E 10

The Mishna : סוכה כט :

A stolen

והירב פסול invalid (for use on Succos as one of the four species)

STATEMENT - The Mishna says, "A stolen and a dry lulav are invalid."

Subject The Mishna is telling us about a stolen and a dry lulav

A STOLEN AND A DRY LULAV are invalid."

Topic Factors which make a lulav invalid for use on Succos

Predicate The Mishna is telling us that such a lulav is invalid

A stolen and a dry lulav ARE INVALID."

Inference The Mishna is assuming that we thought that you MAY use a stolen or a dry lulav or

26 New information The Mishna is telling us that you may NOT use a stolen or a dry lulav on

Scope The Mishna does not specify anyone, so it applies to everyone -

11No-one may use a stolen or dry lulav 11

The Mishna does not specify any time within Succos, so it applies to all Succos -

11Such a lulav is always invalid 11

Authority The Mishna does not say whose opinion it is, so its authority is that of a Stam (r

The Real Message The Mishna is telling us:-

a stolen lulav and a dry lulav are unfit for use by anyone, throughout the whole of Succos.

27 11S E C O N D S T A G E 11

Our reaction to the Statement

Following this statement, we can:

1. Ask more details - 11When can we go swimming?11

e.g. היכי דמי - הכי במאי עסקינן

2. Agree with it - 11Okay! I'm going.11

3. Disagree with it - 11You cannot be correct! 11 e.g.

בי - מתקיף ליה

4. Doubt its correctness - 11How can that be correct? 11 e.g.

מאי לא

We can agree with it by:

i. Our acting according to the statement ii. Bring a proof to it

We can disagree with it by:

i. Agreeing that it is basically correct, but showing that it does not apply now

e.g. 11That was true when there were lifeguards. 11 11Now, there aren't any!11

ii. Showing that the statement is wrong

28 We can show that a statement is wrong by:

a. Showing that it contradicts a superior authority

e.g. 11The Rosh Yeshiva said that we cannot go swimming! 11

b. Proving that it is not logical

We can doubt its correctness, because:

a. It contradicts a statement of equal authority -

e.g. 11But Shimon said that I cannot go swimming 11

b. The statement itself is not clear

The statement itself might not be clear because:

i. It is ambiguous - can be read in different ways resulting in different meanings ii. One part of different part of the statement iii. The statement does not seem to be completely logical iv. It is

29 11S E C O N D S T A G E 11

.R:F The Gemora's reaction to the Mishna

Following this Mishna, the Gemora makes a דיוק

ותני לא שנה ביו"ט ראשון ולא שנה ביום טוב שני 11גמ' 11 קא פסיק

ותני קא פסיק ותני The Mishna does not differentiate between the first day of Yom Tov ( when the mi second day of Yom Tov when the Mitzva is Rabbinical .

Therefore, we should assume that the halacha of the Mishna applies to both days.

Therefore we should assume that the Mishna really means to say that a stolen and a dry lulav are second days of Succos

Regarding this דיוק, the Gemora: 4. Doubts its correctness

בש הדר בעינן וליכא אלא גזול בשלמא יום טוב רשאון דכתיב לכם משלכם אלא ביום טוב שני אמאי לא

בשלמא 30 I can understand why a dry lulav is unfit, because the lulav must be beautiful, and beautiful.

אלא But the Mishna's opinion regarding a stolen lulav does not seem to be reasonable!

בשלמא I can understand why a stolen lulav is unfit for use on the first day, because on the first day of the Torah and the Torah says that it must be yours - not stolen .

אלא But on the second day, when the obligation is only Rabbinical , אמאי לא 12 what is wrong

The Gemora doubts its correctness, because:

b. According to your דיוק the Mishna itself is not clear

The דיוק itself is not clear because:

iii. It does not seem logical

12 Why should a stolen lulav not be suitable 12 12 on the second day, when the obligation is 12

31 12 T H I R D S T A G E 12

Reuven's response

1. Supply more details 2. Counter the disagreements 3. Prove correctness of his original statement

If we disagreed with it by agreeing that it is basically correct, but showing that it does not apply in this case, Reuven can explain that, despite the difference, it does apply now.

If we disagreed with it by showing that the statement is wrong by a. Showing that it contradicts a statement of equal authority. Then Reuven can either show that the superior authority is referring to a different circumstance or show that he has an equal or even higher authority behind him.

If we disagreed with it by b. Proving that it is not logical

Then Reuven can explain himself to show that his statement is logical or that there is a flaw in the statement.

32 If we doubted its correctness, because a. it contradicts a statement of equal authority

Then Reuven can show us that either his statement is backed by a superior authority or the other statement is based on a different circumstance

If we doubted its correctness, because b. The statement itself does not seem to be clear because

i. It is ambiguous - can be read in different ways resulting in different meanings, or ii. one part of the statement is unclear

different part of the statement, iii. or it does not make sense at all iv. or it is too obvious

Then Reuven can explain his statement

Or, Reuven can respond by disproving Shimon's proof or by showing that Shimon's logic is not correct

By pushing off Shimon's attack, Reuven does not thereby PROVE that he is correct, because he has no independent reason.

33 12 T H I R D S T A G E 12

The Gemora's response

1. Supply more details

We doubted the דיוק's correctness, because

b. The Mishna itself would not then seem to be clear because

iii. it would not be logical.

So Rabbi Yochanan quotes Rabbi Shimon ben Yochai, who supplies new information:-

.R:F א"ר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי משום דהוה ליה מצוה הבאה בעבירה

.R:F We assumed that the fitness of a lulav depended only upon whether or not it satisfied the requirements of the actual lulav and its ownership. Since the requirement of ownership only applies to the first day, it is permitted on the second day.

However, Rabbi Shimon ben Yochai tells us there is another requirement which applies to the pe-

34 A stolen lulav is unfit for use on the second day because performing the mitzva with a stolen lulav is through doing a sin.

If the lulav would not have been stolen, the thief could not have used it!

And a mitzva which is performed through an avaira is not counted as being a mitzva!

Therefore, if a person tries to perform the mitzva of lulav with a stolen lulav any time during Succot, it is regarded as a mitzva and he must still fulfil his obligation with a suitable lulav.

### 35 13MAKING A SUMMARY 13

There are five basic ways to make a concise summary:

1. Classified chart 2. Structured Walkthrough 3. Flowchart 4. Flashcard 5. Notebook

Look at the examples in the following pages.

You might find one almost unintelligible, whereas another might be very clear.

Show them to your friend and see how he reacts to them.

He might react completely differently to you.

This is not a question of one person being right and the other being wrong.

People are different.

People think in different ways.

If you do not like any of these diagrams, try to devise your own way to summarize the information.

Most benefit is gained from making a summary.

It forces you to organize information and clarify each part.

After you have made your summary, you can use it to refresh your memory.

But do not be surprised if your friend cannot understand it at all.

### 36 13CLASSIFIED CHART 13

When you compile a Classified Chart, you first must classify the information into groups of similar items.

When similar items are grouped together, you can see the differences between them.

For example, we can group together all the stages, as follows:

STAGE 1 2 3 NAME Statement Reaction Response

Then we can classify the reactions according to the degree of agreement with the statement, as follows:

FOR AGAINST NOT SURE NEUTRAL Agree with Disagree with  
it it correctness

Likewise, we can continue to categorize the various reactions and then continue with the responses.

37 Now, let us chart the times when we can go swimming, according to what people say is the correct time during the Mashgiach.

The Rosh Yeshiva is reported to have said that we can only go swimming during Vacation.

The Mashgiach is reported to have said that we can also go during lunch-break.

.R:C

-	- -		Time of day	- -
Seder	Lunch-break	Vacation	- - -	
Swimming is	Swimming is	Swimming is	- -	says Forbidden Forb

-- Authority -- Mashgiach  
 Swimming is -- says Forbidden Permitted Permitted --  
 ---

38 .R:F Classified Charts of the Sugya we learnt above

Torah Requirements מ ש ל כ ם ה ד ר ש ל ך א ב ל ל א ג ז ל ל ח כ ש ר ז ל

Type of Obligation Mitzva of the Torah יו"ט ראשון Day Mitzva of the Rabt

State of Lulav ג ז ל י ב ש p o s u l p o s u l יו"ט ראשון I  
 יו"ט שני

.R:F 39 Do you like these Charts?

Do you find that they make the topic clearer?

When I first made them, I enjoyed making them and making them helped me to organize my und  
 between the various halachos.

Now that some time has elapsed since I last looked at them, I find that, at first sight, they are con  
 a while, I can remember the subject much better than I could from just trying to remember it pure

A chart is a tool to help you. You will be able to make some topics clearer with one type of chart  
 other types of charts.

You might prefer one type of chart and your friend might prefer a different type.

It's not a question of being right or wrong.

It is a question of what is more useful to you to help you learn, understand and remember.

40 14 S T R U C T U R E D W A L K T H R O U G H 14

A structured walkthrough is like a guided tour of the argument. Each part is mapped out so that  
 part to the other.

For example, we can map out the three stages like this:

.R:F 1 - Statement STAGES 2 - Reaction 3 - Response

Then, we can map out the reactions, like this:

For REACTIONS Against Not Sure Neutral

Then, we can combine them, like this:

1 - Statement For STAGES 2 - Reaction Against 3 - Response Not Sure Neutral

Likewise, you can continue to map out the various reactions in greater detail and then continue v  
 the chart opposite. See if you agree with it and then try to make one more to your liking.

41 Let us now take a look at the following conversation.

Reuven: The Rosh Yeshiva said that I can go swimming during lunch-break today.

Shimon: But he just told us that we may go swimming only during vacation!

Reuven: Right, but I showed him a letter I got from the doctor which says that I need the exerc

1 2 3 4 Re

therefore, by implication Reuven

Rosh Yeshiva Rosh Yeshiva Rosh Yeshiva Rosh Yeshiva says

says Lunch-break Vacation Lu

Swimming Swimming Swimming without with is

note a note Permitted Permitted Permitted swimming swimmin

NOT IS permitted permitted 42 .R:F Structured Walkthrough of the Sugya we lear

ולא שנה ביום טוב שני לא שנה ביו"ט ראשון

3

2



אלאביום טוב שניאמאי לא |

^ | ת ( 16-refutation of attack-16 )

| א"ר יוחנן מצוה הבאה בעבירה : שמעון בן יוחי < משום דהוה ליה

. 47 R:F 16F L A S H C A R D S 16

Flashcards are useful summaries of the sugya which you can carry around with you for quick review. index them and build-up files of sugyas for easy access and future reference.

Flashcard for the Sugya we learnt above

.R:F Page 58 : לולב הגזול פרק שלישי סוכה

לולב הגזול והיבש משנה

lulav which cannot be used

applies to first and second day of p'sul of יבש - דיוק גמרא

so invalidates for both days

for first day

BUT \

day?

ר' יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי

ה הבאה בעבירה -

R:F 16I N D E X C A R D S 16

Index cards are similar to flash cards but they are made for specific topics and then kept in file boxes. when you want to look up a specific topic, you can find the card on that topic easily.

For example you can make up files on halachos, key words, lomdos, quotations, etc.. .R:F

Halachos	הלכות לולב	Topic	Requirements
גמרא	רמב"ם	בבלי סוכה כט :	Must not be dry

Key words	Explanation
49 בשלמה... אלא	two parts, one part of which seen
Differentiation of the Halacha into	בבלי סוכה כט :
of which does not seem reasonable	ני לא שנה ביו"ט ראשון ולא שנה ביום
קא פסיק	אלא גזול בשלמה יום טוב ראשון דכתיב
בשלמה יבש הדר בעינן וליכא	לא
ביום טוב שני אמאי	

Mussar	מצוה הבאה בעבירה	Explanation
do a mitzva if it	בבלי סוכה כט :	entails doing an avaira. If he does try to do
the avairah and he does NOT get the	mitzva.	ותני לא שנה ביו"ט ראשון ולא שנה ביום
פסיק	אלא גזול בשלמה יום טוב ראשון דכתיב	
הדר בעינן וליכא	משום דהוה ליה מצוה הבאה בעבירה	

לא א"ר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי

. 50R:F 16N O T E B O O K S 16

Notebooks are an efficient way to store summaries of entire Mesechtos so that they are always available. Number each page of the notebook according to the pages of the Gemora.

Then, after you have learnt a passage of Gemora, write a short summary on the corresponding page. When composing the summary, try to imagine that you are teaching someone the main points of the Gemora. Formulating the clearest and most concise way to express the sugya will often force you to attain a deeper understanding of the Gemora.

A frequent complaint is that after having learnt a Mesechta (or even just part of a mesechto) it is difficult to recall the Gemora in its entirety, in the original format. So, there can be a tendency to forget what has been

This is both wasteful and disenheartening.

A collection of notebooks will help you keep mesechtos you have learnt in the past continually fr

51 .R:C ל סוכה ל פרק שלישי סוכה לולב הגוזל פרק שני סוכה לולב הגוזל 58 הישן תחת המטה פרק שני סוכה לולב הגוזל פרק שלישי סוכה ל .R:C

have rebuked & didn't

4. Collected צדקה & didn't give it

Because of 4 things בעיב lose money

1. Don't pay workers on

2. Don't pay workers at all

3. Push their responsibilities

4. Pride

and pride is the worst

פרק שלישי לולב הגוזל

1. Stolen & dry

2. Ashaira & עיר הנידחת

Head cut off

4. Leaves detached and tied back c

5. Leaves splayed out - כשר

Rabbi Yehuda - bind them tog

6. Tzinai Har Barzel - כשר

7. Has 3 tefochim for shaking - שר

GEMORA: לולב Stolen and dry פסול - always

- הדר both days - not פסול

Stolen - פסול first day - Torah - שלכם

second day - דרבנן Why פסול?

Answer: ר"ר יוחנן משום רבי שמעון בן יוחי

משום דהוה ליה מצוה הבאה בעבירה

Quest

on

second day (דרבנן) but stolen might be ok?

גוזר were not בעינן

משלכם that we need

. 52 R:F 17C HOOSING A METHOD17

As we have mentioned several times before, choosing a method of diagraming is a very personal personality, mood, type of sugya, etc.

No type of diagram is intrinsically better than the other.

But usually, some are more useful than others for certain jobs.

### 1. Classified chart

Classified charts are very useful for organizing sugyas in which there are many permutations of a opinions of several Rabbonim regarding one situation, or the halacha of what to do regarding one

### 2. Structured Walkthrough

Structured Walkthroughs are particularly useful for seeing the overall picture of a complicated Si With practice, you will be able to chart a Walkthrough while you are actually learning a sugya.

### 3. Flowchart

Flowcharts are valuable tools to help you actually work through a long, complicated sugya, perhaps finally clarified until the end of a long introduction.

If you find that you cannot see your way through a sugya, or if you find that you are stuck on a p past it, go back to the beginning of the sugya and try to make either a Structured Walkthrough o Flashcard/Index cards

Flashcard/Index cards are nice to carry around with you so that you can revise at odd moments.

They also form a valuable quick-access archives of information if they are filed away in good ord

### 5. Notebook

Notebooks are excellant for continual revision of previously- learnt mesechtos and individual per

.R:F Apart from the long-term benefits of these methods, deeper understanding of the sugya just from the discipline of organizing and order to write it down as succintly as possible.

## .R:F 54 18THE CLASSIC METHOD18

After discussing all these sophisticated methods for organizing, clarifying and helping to remember, forget the most primary method - saying the Gemora by heart!

Say the Gemora out aloud. After you have learnt a passage of Gemora, close the Gemora and say the discussion of the Gemora over and over until you can repeat the entire sugya clearly. When you have finished learning a Sugya. This was the way the Talmidei Chachomim always learnt it. Rabbi A. Y. Epstein שליט"א (Mashgiach, Yeshiva Torah Ore, Jerusalem)

The first time you try to repeat the Gemora, you will probably find that you cannot remember large parts. Try to remember and if, after a few minutes of thinking, you cannot remember, look back into the Gemora. Eventually, you will be able to repeat the entire sugya, then the whole perek, and eventually, the entire tractate. Learning like this, with a chaverusa, makes it enjoyable. While you try to say the Gemora, he checks you and you check him as he tries to remember it.

This also introduces an element of friendly competition and ensures that you do not inadvertently let your partner be checking you from his open Gemora.

55 While you are trying to repeat the Gemora, you will probably find that you cannot see the connections (even though it seemed clear when you learnt it originally). One of the most important benefits of this method is that it helps to isolate points which you really do not understand 100% clearly.

If the sugya is complicated, you can use one of the previously- described techniques for clarifying difficult points so that it will be easier for you to remember. But you should then return to your efforts to memorize the sugya. Rather than trying to learn an entire large sugya, it is easier to break it down into small bites and learn them together.

.PR 56 .H: The First Levels Part 3 Standard Words and Phrases .H:... .H: .H: .F: .I

## PART 2

### STANDARD WORDS

### AND

### PHRASES

57 An important stage in learning through a sugya is recognizing the standard words and phrases. These standard words and phrases serve as signposts, indicating the way the discussion is going. The exact meanings of standard words and phrases has been the topic of many classic seforim, in early Acharonim. However, a valuable accessory to learning how to learn is for you to make your own. As you learn through the Gemora, look out for words or phrases which appear time after time with a meaning proceeding or going to proceed.

For example, the Gemora might say

הכא במאי עסקינן אילימא ..... אלא (לאו) ..... לא לעולם .....

If you recognize this standard pattern, then as soon as you see the first few words עסקינן אילימא the Gemora to tell a first explanation which the Gemora will then refute. Then the Gemora will introduce an explanation introduced by אלא (לאו) which might also be refuted.

Then the Gemora might return to the original explanation, introduced by לא לעולם. Then, the Gemora's original refutation does not deter us from reconsidering that original explanation.

Preferably, write down these standard words and phrases onto cards which you can file in alphabetical order. Write down the literal translation. Then, define the exact function which it plays in the argument and quote it.

58 Then, when you meet this phrase again, see how it matches your definition. You might need to accommodate its use in other places, or you might decide that the word or phrase can actually be used in distinct ways. You will then need to give a clear definition of each use.

In the following section are descriptions of some common standard words and phrases. Some of them are different ways to those described. Some of them might be the subject of argument between authorities.

Use them as a rough guide to making your own list.

Accustom yourself to isolating the reality of the words - how would you use them in your own discussion?

59 רומיא .R:F

Rebbi . . . raised-up רמי . . . רבי And he raised-up ורמינהי And they raised-up מינהו .  
 Contradicting a statement by quoting a source of equal authority which gives a different decision

One person uses an authoritative source to prove his opinion. So another person questions the validity of a contradictory source of equal authority.

Reuven said to Shimon, " I'm going swimming because the Mashgiach said that we can go swimming." Shimon responded, " But the Rosh Yeshiva said that we're not allowed to go swimming!" (Not to be confused with Reuven - he is only bewildered by the fact that the Mashgiach contradicted what the Mashgiach said.)

Possible response ישוב

Reuven can say, " The Mashgiach was talking about going during the seder, but I asked the Rosh Yeshiva for a break and he said it was okay."

60 .R:F Analysis .R:F

1. Reuven implies that it is okay for him to go swimming, "I am going swimming."
2. Reuven backs-up the statement by quoting an authority, "The Mashgiach said we can go swimming."
3. Shimon counters by quoting another authority of similar seniority which contradicts and therefore refutes Reuven's back-up, "But the Rosh Yeshiva said that we're not allowed to go swimming!"

## CONCLUSION

We are now in a quandary.

We cannot say that Reuven is wrong, because he has the Rosh Yeshiva behind him.

On the other hand, we would not like to go against the Mashgiach.

So, we cannot stop Reuven from going swimming, but he cannot convince us that we can go with

There are now several options open.

i. Reuven can now explain that in fact there is no contradiction between the two authorities. Both in different circumstances, and the statement which seems to go against him actually does not apply

61 ii. Reuven can try to prove that we do not have to worry about the authority quoted against him

a. the quotation is not accurate, or b. the statement is wrong, or c. he is not bound by that authority

iii. Reuven has nothing to say about the contradiction

4. In our case, Reuven explains that in fact there is no contradiction between the two authorities. Both in different circumstances, and the statement which seems to go against him actually does not apply

5. The Mashgiach said that it is okay to go because he was referring to going during lunch-break

6. The Rosh Yeshiva said that it is wrong to go because he was talking about going during seder

62 .R:F 1 Reuven 2 I am going The Mashgiach We can go < swimming

: